APPENDIX 1

THE *RITUAL* OF RADOSLAV THE CHRISTIAN

It is known from the accounts of Euthymius of the Periblepton and Euthymius Zigabenus that by the eleventh century the Bogomils had a liturgy, but no text of it has survived.¹ All the Cathars in western Europe used essentially the same form of liturgy, which is first attested in 1163 and thus predated the schisms which developed in the last quarter of the twelfth century.² Because the forms of worship contained in the two surviving exemplars of the Cathar *Ritual* correspond very closely to the descriptions of Bogomil worship in Byzantine sources, it seems reasonable to assume that the Cathar *Ritual* is derived from a lost Bogomil exemplar.³ Christine Thouzellier tried to demonstrate a western provenance for it, but as Duvernoy has shown, she could only prove her case in regard to the gloss on the Lord's prayer, which is the only part of the *Ritual* which the officiant was able to extemporize.⁴

Part of a Slavonic ritual is preserved in a manuscript which is now in the Vatican Library. It was written by Radoslav the Christian for Goisak the Christian in the reign of King Stephen Thomas of Bosnia (1443–61).⁵ Some experts in Old Slavonic palaeography have argued that this *Ritual* may have been copied from a twelfth-century exemplar.⁶ The text resembles very closely that of the opening section of the Cathar *Ritual* of Lyons, and there is no doubt that it was intended for use in worship by the fifteenth-century Bosnian dualists. Because of its late date and because Bosnia had been heavily influenced by western Cathars it is possible, though not in our view very likely, that this text was translated from a western original.⁷ But because it may not be an authentic Bogomil text we have placed it in an appendix.

The text is that of the Vatican Library, MS Borgiano Illyrico 12, fos. 56–8, and this translation has been made by Yori Stoyanov from Thouzellier's *Rituel cathare*, pp. 287–9, where it is printed alongside the text of the Cathar *Ritual* of Lyons. We have supplied the rubrics.

[The Lord's Prayer]

Our Father, who art in heaven, hallowed be Thy name; Thy kingdom come, Thy will be done in earth as in heaven. Give us this day our daily

1 See above, [19], [25].

2 Egbert of Schonau, *Sermones contra Catharos* 8.2 (PL 195, 51).

3 Hamilton, 'Wisdom from the East', pp. 46–9.

4 Thouzellier, *Rituel cathare*, pp. 182–4; Duvernoy, *Le Catharisme*, unnumbered final pages, 'Addition à la conclusion'.

5 Fine, *The Bosnian Church*, p. 304.

6 Thouzellier, *Rituel cathare*, pp. 64–5.

7 Fine, *The Bosnian Church*, p. 83.

bread⁸ and forgive us our debts, as we forgive our debtors, and lead us not into temptation, [but] deliver us from evil. For Thine are the kingdom and the power and the glory for ever. Amen.⁹

[Litany]

Let us adore the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit.

It is right and worthy [to do so].¹⁰

Let us adore the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit.

Let us adore the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit.

The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with [us] all evermore. Amen.

Bless us, forgive us. Amen.

Be it unto us, O Lord, according to Thy word.

May the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit deliver you, may they forgive you all your sins.

[The opening words of St John's gospel]

In the beginning was the Word and the Word was of God and the Word was God. All things were made by Him, and without Him there was nothing which exists.¹¹ In Him was life, and the life was the light of men. And the light shone in the darkness and the darkness did not master it. There was a man sent from God whose name was John. He came as a witness to bear witness to the light so that all might believe through him. He was not the light, [but] the witness of the light. The true light was in

8 'Daily bread' in the Slavonic and RSV versions of the Lord's Prayer is a translation of the Greek *epiousion arton*. In the Latin Vulgate the rare first word of this phrase was translated to give *panem supersubstantialem* (which might be translated either as 'bread which is more than sufficient' or 'more than physical') in Matt. 6.11, and *panem cotidianum* ('daily bread') in Luke 11.3. Both versions were orthodox, but the Cathars found *supersubstantialem* more attractive.

9 Euthymius of the Priblepton accuses the Byzantine Bogomils of leaving out the doxology of the Lord's Prayer; see [19]. The Cathars always said it, and the Bosnian Bogomils may have adopted it under Cathar influence.

10 The Cathar *Ritual* does not contain this phrase, but its use by the Byzantine Bogomils of the mid-eleventh century is attested by Euthymius of the Priblepton [19]. That is probably not very significant. This is one of the most ancient Christian liturgical phrases, attested by St Hippolytus as being in use in Rome during the third century and subsequently used by almost all the churches of East and West; see *The Apostolic tradition of St Hippolytus*, ed. Dix, p. 7.

11 St Augustine described this form of punctuation of John 1.3 as Manichaean, but it had been used by earlier Christian writers who were orthodox. This punctuation is therefore simply a textual variant, but one which was preferred by dualists as more consonant with their beliefs; that the material world is 'nothing' and that God has not made it. See Thouzellier, *Catharisme et Valdisme*, pp. 404–5.

being which gives light to everyone entering the world. He was in the world and the world was made by Him and the world knew Him not. He came unto his own and His own received Him not. To those who received Him he gave the power to become the children of God, to those who believe in His name, those who were born not of blood nor of the lust of the flesh nor of the lust of man but of God. And the Word became flesh and dwelt among us, and we beheld his glory, like that of the only son of the Father, full of grace and truth. John bore witness to Him and proclaimed [Him] saying: here is He of whom I said, 'He who comes after me takes precedence over me, because He was before me.' Of his fulness we have all received grace upon grace. For the law was given from Moses, [but] grace and truth are given us through Jesus Christ.

[St Paul's Epistle to Titus, 2.12, 13]

And the Apostle Paul speaks in his Epistle to Titus of renouncing the godlessness and lusts of the flesh in order to live a life of chastity and godliness in this present age, awaiting the blessed hope and the manifestation of the glory of our great God.¹²

¹² This passage is not found in the Cathar *Ritual* of Lyons.